The opinion in support of the decision being entered today was *not* written for publication and is *not* binding precedent of the Board.

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

Ex parte GARRETT N. FORD

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570 Technology Center 3600

Decided: May 17, 2007

Before DONALD E. ADAMS, LORA M. GREEN, and RICHARD M. LEBOVITZ, *Administrative Patent Judges*.

Adams, Administrative Patent Judge.

DECISION ON APPEAL

This appeal under 35 U.S.C. § 134 involves claims 1-4 and 13-17, the only claims pending in this application. We have jurisdiction under 35 U.S.C. § 6(b).

INTRODUCTION

The claims are directed to a bushing (claims 13-17) and a stirrup comprising, *inter alia*, a bushing (claims 1-4). Claims 1, 13, and 15 are illustrative:

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570

1. A stirrup comprising:

a carrier;

a holding member on said carrier for holding a strap;

a footrest joined to said carrier; and

a bushing mounted on said holding member;

wherein the bushing includes an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the holding member, longitudinal fins extending radially from the inner sleeve, and an outer sleeve connected to said fins.

13. A bushing for a stirrup holding member comprising:

an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the holding member;

an outer sleeve substantially concentric with the inner sleeve;

a plurality of longitudinal ribs connecting the inner and outer sleeves.

15. The bushing of claim 13, wherein said bushing is made of polyurethane.

The Examiner relies on the following prior art references to show unpatentability:

Bowman

and

US 3,515,417

Jun. 2, 1970

Hsi-Chang

US 6,220,004 B1

Apr. 24, 2001

This Merits Panel relies on the following reference:

(Webster's) Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary 154 (10th ed. 1998).

The rejections as presented by the Examiner are as follows:

- 1. Claims 13 and 14 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman (Br. 4).
- 2. Claims 15-17 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman (Br. 4).
- 3. Claims 1-4 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman (Br. 4).

We reverse.

DISCUSSION

CLAIM INTERPRETATION

Claim 13 is drawn to a bushing. The Specification does not include a definition for the term "bushing." Therefore, we interpret the term "bushing" as defined in a general purpose dictionary to mean a "removable cylindrical lining for an opening (as a mechanical part) used to limit the size of the opening, resist abrasion, or serve as a guide" (Webster's). The bushing of claim 13 comprises three elements: (1) an inner sleeve adapted for snug connection with the stirrup holding member (e.g., the rod of a stirrup (Specification 4)), (2) an outer sleeve substantially concentric with the inner sleeve, and (3) a plurality of longitudinal ribs connecting the inner and outer sleeves.

Claim 1 is drawn to a stirrup. The stirrup comprises four elements: (1) a carrier; (2) a holding member on the carrier for holding a strap; (3) a footrest joined to the carrier; and (4) a bushing, as in claim 13, mounted on the holding member.

BOWMAN

Bowman teaches a self-centering bushing (Bowman, title).

Bowman's bushing is preferably made from a plastic material, e.g., nylon (Bowman, col. 1, 11. 30-31). Bowman's bushing has

an accurately formed inner bore to receive an accurately formed rod, pedestal or the like [(e.g., a holding member)] and the outer surface of the bushing being provided with a multiplicity of longitudinally extending apline [sic]-like members, the outer ends of which are adapted to contact the bore of the member in which the bushing is placed, the splines being flexible enough at their outer ends to make the bushing self centering relative to the bore of the hub.

(Bowman, col. 1, 11. 30-39.) Bowman's bushing does not contain an outer sleeve that is substantially concentric with the inner sleeve.

Bowman describes the use of the bushing in the base of a swivel chair (Bowman, col. 1, 1. 63 - col. 2, 1. 51). Bowman teaches that the bushing is placed in a disposed hub in the swivel chair's base where the inner bore of the bushing is positioned to receive a rod-like pedestal attached to the upper portion of the chair (id.).

Claims 13 and 14 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman.

The Examiner finds that Bowman's bushing comprises an inner sleeve (bore) and a plurality of longitudinal fins (ribs) (Answer 3-4; Final Rejection 2). We agree that Bowman teaches, an inner sleeve and a plurality of longitudinal fins, two of the three limitations of Appellant's claim 13. As we understand the Examiner's argument, when Bowman's bushing is inserted in the disposed hub of a swivel chair's base, the disposed hub of the chair's base provides an outer sleeve for Bowman's bushing (*id.*).

Therefore, the Examiner is of the opinion that the disposed hub of the chair's base provides the third required element of Appellant's claim 13.

We appreciate the Examiner's construction of Appellant's claimed invention in light of Bowman. When interpreted broadly, the transitional phrase "comprising" opens the claim to read on elements that are not recited in Appellant's claim, e.g., a bushing together with a swivel chair base.

Georgia-Pacific Corp. v. United States Gypsum Co., 195 F.3d 1322, 1327, 52 USPQ2d 1590, 1595 (Fed. Cir. 1999).

However, as we have interpreted the term, a "bushing" is a removable cylindrical lining. As Appellant explains, "[a] bushing constitutes a discrete and distinct member. . ." (Br. 5). Therefore, to reach Appellant's claimed bushing, the prior art bushing must have all three of Appellant's claimed elements whether it is held in your hand or placed in the disposed hub of a swivel chair base. Bowman does not teach a bushing that contains an outer sleeve that is substantially concentric with the inner sleeve. Therefore, Bowman does not teach a bushing having the claimed structure.

Accordingly, we reverse the rejection of claims 13 and 14 under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Bowman.

Claims 15-17 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman.

Claims 15-17 depend from and further limit claim 13 to, *inter alia*, a bushing that is made of polyurethane (claims 15 and 16), or wherein the plurality of longitudinal ribs consists of four ribs (claim 17). As discussed above, Bowman fails to teach a bushing having all three elements of Appellant's claim 13. The Examiner offers no explanation as to why a person of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made would

have found it prima facie obvious to add an outer sleeve to Bowman's selfcentering bushing.

Therefore, for the reasons set forth above, we reverse the rejection of claims 15-17 under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over Bowman.

HSI-CHANG AND BOWMAN

Claims 1-4 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman.

The Examiner finds that Hsi-Chang teaches a stirrup that comprises a bushing (Final Rejection 3; Answer 5). The Examiner finds that "Hsi-Chang is silent about the bushing includ[ing] an inner sleeve and longitudinal fins extending radially from the inner sleeve" (Final Rejection 3). To make up for the deficiencies in His-Chang, the Examiner relies on Bowman as discussed above (*id*.). The Examiner finds that it would have been prima facie obvious to substitute the bushing of Hsi-Chang with a functionally equivalent bushing having inner sleeve and fins as taught by Bowman, since both types of bushing would perform to guide or reduce friction between elements (Answer 5).

As discussed above, Bowman fails to teach a bushing with an outer sleeve. Therefore, the rejection fails even if it would have been obvious to substitute Bowman's bushing for Hsi-Chang's bushing. Accordingly, we reverse the rejection of claims 1-4 under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as unpatentable over the combination of Hsi-Chang and Bowman.

Appeal 2007-1716 Application 10/743,570

CONCLUSION

In summary, we reverse all grounds of rejection.

REVERSED

lbg

QUARLES & BRADY LLP ONE SOUTH CHURCH AVENUE, SUITE 1700 TUCSON AZ 85701-1621



Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary

TENTH EDITION

Merriam-Webster, Incorporated Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A.



マガニーデースペントーの機能を開催する

A GENUINE MERRIAM WEBSTER

The name Webster alone is no guarantee of excellence. It is used by a number of publishers and may serve mainly to mislead an unwary buyer.

Merriam-Webster, is the name you should look for when you consider the purchase of dictionaries or other fine reference books. It carries the reputation of a company that has been publishing since 1831 and is your assurance of quality and authority.

Copyright ©:1998 by Merriam Webster, Incorporated

Philippines Copyright 1998 by Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Main entry under title:

Merriam-Webster's collegiate dictionary. - 10th ed.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-87779-708-0 (unindexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-709-9 (indexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-710-2 (deluxe indexed : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-87779-707-2 (laminated cover, unindexed).

1. English language-Dictionaries. I. Merriam-Webster, Inc.

PE1628.M36 1998

-dć21

Merriam-Webster's Collegiate® Dictionary, Tenth Edition principal copyright 1993

COLLEGIATE is a registered trademark of Merriam-Webster, Incorporated

All rights reserved. No part of this book covered by the copyrights hereon may be reproduced or copied in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, taping, or information storage and retrieval systems—without written permission of the publisher.

Made in the United States of America

21222324RMcN98

Abbı

THE PROPERTY OF THE PARTY OF TH

12:3

ğιn.

TOC. .br... . 13c.,

3251

Fire. 2005. 1. z. 1070 1000

癫 示 MOON. 3/1 Thur. tion!

Zidi /

20t: "

637 68.5 35 L td'i

Bu.

Carry.

To m.

Tista.

en: 11 901 July Bette

THE. WAND IL

37.1

Fati \$15.0 dian. erest.

2011 Marin

make a motion suggestive of burrowing : SNUGGLE. NESTLE (~ed against his back for warmth) — bur-row-er n burrstone var of BUHRSTONE

burrstone var of BUHRSTONE
burry \'bor-\ell' adj bur-ri-\er; -\est (15c) 1 : containing burs 2
: PRICKLY 3 of speech : characterized by a burr
bur-sa \'bor-sa\ n, pl bur-sas \-\esz\ or bur-sae \-\esi\. [NL, fr. ML, bag, purse — more at PURSE] (1803) : a bodily pouch or sac: as a : a small serous sac between a tendon and a bone b: BURSA OF FABRICIUS — bur-see \-\est{log} \-\est{log} \frac{1}{2} \frac

small serous sac between a tendon and a bone b: EURSA OF FABRICIUS — bur-sal \-sal\ adj bursa of Fa-bri-cius \-f-brē-sh(ē-)as, -'bri-, -s(ē-)as\ [Johan C. Fa-bricius † 1808 Dan. entomologist] (1945): a lymphoid organ that opens into the cloaca of birds and functions in B cell production bur-sar \'bor-sa-r, -, sār\ n [ML bursarius, fr. bursa] (13c): an officer (as of a monastery or college) in charge of funds: TREASURER bursary \'bor-sa-rē, 'bors-rē n, pl -ries [ML bursaria, fr. bursa] (1695) 1: the treasury of a college or monastery 2 Brit: a monetary grant to a needy student: SCHOLARSHIP burse \'bors\ n [MF bourse, fr. ML bursa] (15c) 1 a: PURSE b: a square cloth case used to carry the corporal in a Communion service 2 obs: EXCHANGE BOURSE bur-si-tis \(\(\)\)\)bor-'sī-tas\ n [NL, fr. bursa] (1857): inflammation of a bursa esp. of the shoulder or elbow

travel by bus 2: to work as a busboy ~ vt 1: to transport by bus 2 a clear 4d (~ dishes) b: to remove dirty dishes from (~ tables)
bus bar n (1893): a conductor or an assembly of conductors for collecting electric currents and distributing them to outgoing feeders bus-boy 'bos-bōi\ n [omnibus busboy] (1913): a waiter's assistant; specif: one who removes dirty dishes and resets tables in a restaurant bus-by 'boz-bēn, n' busbies [prob. fr. the name Busby] (1853) 1: a military full-dress fur hat with a pendent bag on one side usu. of the color of regimental facings 2: the bearskin worn by British guardsmen — not used by the guardsmen themselves
'bush 'bush', n, often attrib [ME; akin to OHG busc forest] (14c) 1 a
: SHRUB; esp: a low densely branched shrub b: a close thicket of shrubs suggesting a single plant 2: a large uncleared or sparsely settled area (as in Australia) usu. scrub-covered or forested: wilder outside a tavern to indicate wine for sale b obs: TAVERN c: ADVERTISHO (good wine needs no ~ Shak.) 4: a bushy tuft or mass (a ~ of hair); esp: 'arrush 2a 5: minor league—usu. used in pl. 'abush v (15c): to support, mark, or protect with bushes ~ vi: to extend like a bush: resemble a bush
'bush adj (1595) 1: having a low-growing compact bushy habit—used esp. of cultivated beans (~ snap beans) 2: serving, occurring in, or used in the bush (~ planes)
'bush adj (1595) 1: GALAGO
'bush adj (1506) chiefly Brit: BUSHING
'bush adj (1506) chiefly Brit: BUSHING
'bush adj (1507): a sweet basil of a cultivar with small leaves
bush bush no (1597): a sweet basil of a cultivar with small leaves
bush bush (1822): a small African striped antelope (Tragelaphus scriptus) esp. of sub-Saharan forests that has spirally twisted horns
bush down (1818): a small African striped antelope (Tragelaphus scriptus) esp. of sub-Saharan forests that has spirally twisted horns
bush clover n (ca. 1818): any of several usu. shrubby lespedezas
'bushed 'bushiv adj (14c) 1: covered with or as if with a bushy growth 2 chiefly Austral a: lost esp. i

table 2: a container holding a bushel 3: a large quantity: Lore (makes ~s of money)

*bushel vb bush-eled; bush-el-ing \-sh(s-)lin\ [prob. fr. G bosself[u]
do poor work, to patch; akin to OE beatan to beat] (ca. 1877): REPAIL
REMOVATE — bush-el-er \-sh(s-)lsr\ n
bush-fire \'bush-fir\ n (1832) Austral: an uncontrolled fire in abush area

black 7(1840 a)com 15lang bust

Dush-Irre \Oush-irr\ n (1852) Austral: an uncontrolled lire in a sussarea
Bu-shi-do \'bù-shi-,dō, 'bū-\ n [Jp bushidō] (1898): a feudal-militar
Japanese code of chivalry valuing honor above life
bush-ing \'bū-shi\ n (1839) 1: a usu, removable cylindrical linin
for an opening (as of a mechanical part) used to limit the size of the
opening, resist abrasion, or serve as a guide 2: an electrically insular
ing lining for a hole to protect a through conductor
bush jacket n [Ir. its use in rough country] (ca. 1939): a long cottojacket resembling a shirt and having four patch pockets and a belt
bush-land \'būsh-alnd\ n (1827): \bush 2
bush-league adj (1914): being of an inferior class or group of its kind
bush league n (1909): MINOR LEAGUE — bush leaguer n
bush-man \'būsh-mon\ n (1785) 1 cap [modif. of obs. Afrik bocklis
man, fr. boschie (dim. of bosch forest) + Afrik man] a: a member
a group of short-statured peoples of southern Africa who traditional
live by hunting and foraging b: the Khoisan languages spokento
these people 2 a: wOODSMAN b chiefly Austral: a person who live
in the bush
bush-mas-ter \mas-tar\ n (1826): a tropical American pit vice

a group of short-statured peoples of southern Africa who traditional live by hunting and foraging b: the Khoisan languages spoken these people 2 a: woodsman b chiefly Austral: a person who live in the bush-mas-ter \.mas-tar\ n (1826): a tropical American pit wing (Lachesis mutus) that is the largest New World venomous snake bush-pig \.pig\ n (1840): a wild usu. reddish to black pig (Potama choerus porcus) of forests and scrubland of sub-Saharan Africa an Madagascar that has much facial hair, long pointed ears, and at light colored mane along the top of the neck and back bush pilot n (1936): a pilot who flies a small plane into remote areas bush-rang-er \.ranjar\ nijr\ n (1801): 1 Austral: an outlaw living into bush 2: prontiersman woodsman—bush-rang-ing \.jin\ n bush shirt n [fr. its use in rough country] (1909): a usu. loose-fittin cotton shirt with patch pockets
bush-tit \.\., iti\ n (ca. 1889): a small gray titmouse (Psaltriparus mus) of western No. America with light underparts that occurs in seral geographic forms sometimes placed in separate species
bush-whack\ bush-hwak\, wak\ wb [back-formation fr. bush-whadle bush-hack\ bush-hwak\, wak\ wb [back-formation fr. bush-whadle of the human bush-whadle bush-liv bush-sh-la adv—bush-less \ bush-liv had bush-less \ bush-liv ha

and practices
business card n (1840): a small card bearing information (as nan and address) about a business or business representative business cycle n (1919): a cycle of economic activity usu. consists of recession, recovery, growth, and decline business end n (1878): the end with, from, or through which a thing function is fulfilled (the business end of a revolver) business-like \big\text{'biz-nss-lik}, \tausle \big\text{-nz-\adj} (1791) 1: exhibiting qualitabelieved to be advantageous in business 2: SERIOUS, PURPOSEFUL business-man \man, \man \hat n (1826): a man who transacts business-peo-ple \mathred \text{pē-pol} \n pl (1865): persons active in business business-per-son \man, \man \hat (1974): a businessman or business woman

pusi-ness-per-son \, ppr-s'n\ n (1974): a businessman or busines woman business suit n (1870): a man's suit consisting of matching coal in trousers and sometimes a vest busi-ness-wom-an \, wu-man\ n (1844): a woman who transac business; esp: a female business executive bus-ing or bus-sing \'bo-sin\ n (1923): the act of transporting by bus-specif: the transporting of children to a school outside their resident area as a means of establishing racial balance in that school busk-er \'bos-k-or\ n [busk, prob. fr. It buscare to procure, gain, fr. buscare to look for 1 (1857) chiefly Brit: a person who entertains explaying music on the street — busk \'bosk\ vibus-kin \'bos-kon\ n [prob. modif. of MF brozequin] (1503) laced boot reaching halfway or more to the knee 2 a: COTHUNNO b: TRAGEDY: esp: tragedy resembling that of ancient Greek drama' bus-load \'bos-lod\ n (1938): a load that fills a bus (~s of tourists) bus-man's holiday \'bos-manz-\ n (1893): a holiday spent in following or observing the practice of one's usual occupation

Notice of References Cited

Application/Control No. 10/743,570		Applicant(s)/Patent Under Reexamination	
Examiner	Art Unit	Page 1 of 1	

U.S. PATENT DOCUMENTS

	U.S. FATENT DOCUMENTS				
*		Document Number Country Code-Number-Kind Code	Date MM-YYYY	Name	Classification
	Α	US-			
	В	US-			
	С	US-			
	D	US-			
	E	US-			
	F	US-			
	G	US-			
	Н	US-			
	Ι	US-			
	J	US-			
	К	US-			
	L	US-			
	М	US-			

FOREIGN PATENT DOCUMENTS

*		Document Number Country Code-Number-Kind Code	Date MM-YYYY	Country	Name	Classification
	N					
	0	_				
	Р					
	Q					
	R					
	S					
	Т	:				

NON-PATENT DOCUMENTS

*		Include as applicable: Author, Title Date, Publisher, Edition or Volume, Pertinent Pages)
	U	(Webster's) Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary 154 (10 th ed. 1998).
	V	
	w	
	x	

A copy of this reference is not being furnished with this Office action. (See MPEP § 707.05(a).) Dates in MM-YYYY format are publication dates. Classifications may be US or foreign.